

# Is the Friday Prayer Obligatory After the 'Īd Prayer if 'Īd Should Fall on a Friday?

A Translation From the *Bidāyat al-Mujtahid* of Ibn Rushd  
al-Hafīd al-Qurṭubī, An Authoritative Manual on the *Fiqh*  
of the Four *Madhhabs* and the People of the *Sunnah*

Translated by Ḥamzah wald Maqbūl

## هل تجب صلاة الجمعة بعد صلاة العید إذا وافق العید يوم الجمعة؟

مأخوذ من كلام العلامة ابن  
رشد الحفيد القرطبي في كتابه  
المشهور "بداية المجتهد" في فقه  
المذاهب الأربعة و أهل السنة

ترجمه عبد الله الفقير

حمزة ولد مقبول

[The people of knowledge] have differed about [what to do] when the *ʿīd* and the Friday fall on the same day: would the *ʿīd* [prayer] suffice [one who prayed it] in place of the Friday prayer? A group [of the people of knowledge] said: “The *ʿīd* [prayer] suffices [one who prayed it] in place of the Friday [prayer], and such a person is not obligated to pray [after the *ʿīd* prayer, anything] except *ʿAṣr*.” This is the opinion of *ʿAṭā*, and it has been attributed to Ibn Zubayr and *ʿAlī* [may Allah be well pleased with them].

[Another] group said, “This is a dispensation meant for Bedouin nomads who come especially to a metropolis only for *ʿīd* and the Friday prayer.” This is in accord with what has been attributed to Sayyidunā *ʿUthmān*, [may Allah be well pleased with him,] that he gave the *khuṭbah* of *ʿīd* on a Friday, then said, “Whoever of the people of *ʿĀliyah*<sup>1</sup> wishes to await the Friday prayer, let him wait; whoever wishes to return, let him return.”

[This] was narrated by Mālik in the *Muwaṭṭaʿ*, and similar has been attributed to *ʿUmar ibn ʿAbd al-ʿAzīz*, and Shāfiʿī has chosen it [as his *fatwā*, may Allah have mercy upon them all]<sup>2</sup>.

واختلفوا إذا اجتمع في يوم واحد عيد، وجمعة، هل يجزئ العيد عن الجمعة؟ فقال قوم: يجزئ العيد عن الجمعة، وليس عليه في ذلك اليوم إلا العصر فقط، وبه قال عطاء، وروي ذلك عن ابن الزبير، وعلي.

وقال قوم: هذه رخصة لاهل البوادي الذين يردون الامصار للعيد والجمعة خاصة. كما روي عن عثمان أنه خطب في يوم عيد وجمعة فقال: من أحب من أهل العالية أن ينتظر الجمعة، فلينتظر، ومن أحب أن يرجع، فليرجع رواه مالك في الموطأ وروي نحوه عن عمر بن عبد العزيز، وبه قال الشافعي.

<sup>1</sup> *ʿĀliyah* here is a reference to *ʿAwālī*, an area outside of the city of Madīnah which extends from the border of the city, to about three miles out. The people of *ʿAwālī* were expected to come to the city for the Friday prayer, except that Sayyidunā *ʿUthmān* exempted them from having to do so, if they prayed *ʿīd* on a Friday in Madīnah (al-Bāḥī, *al-Muntaqā*).

<sup>2</sup> Note that Shāfiʿī’s opinion is that missing the Friday prayer after having prayed *ʿīd* is a dispensation for Bedouins like the people of *ʿAwālī* only, and not those who actually live in the city.

Mālik and Abū Hanīfah said, when ‘īd and Friday coincide, a legally responsible person is expected to perform both: ‘īd because it is a *sunnah*<sup>3</sup>, and the Friday prayer, because it is obligatory. [They maintain that] neither one takes the place of the other; this is the default assumption that is to be taken, unless there is some [explicit] legislation to the contrary which [is so strong that one] is obliged to change [one’s opinion] to it.<sup>4</sup>

Those who take the opinion of [Sayyidunā] ‘Uthmān [do so] because it is a matter that one cannot deduce by mere opinion; rather [according to them], it can be nothing other than [a *fatwā*] in accordance [to the *sunnah*]. [Also] it is not totally outside the bounds of the default state [of the *sharīah*, as it still has most people obliged to pray the Friday prayer].

As for dropping the obligatory *ḍhuhr* and Friday prayers, which would be dropped in the place of the ‘īd prayer, this would be very much against the default state [of the rulings of the *sharīah* and has no weight] unless there is some explicit legislation to the contrary, which [is so strong that one] is obliged to follow it.<sup>5i</sup> [The scholars of this opinion further] differed about one who missed the ‘īd prayer with the Imām. A group said that he should pray four [*raka‘āt*]. This is the opinion of [Imāms] Aḥmad and [Sufyān] al-Thawrī. It is also attributed to [‘Abdullāh] ibn Mas‘ūd, [may Allah be pleased with them all].

وقال مالك وأبو حنيفة: إذا اجتمع عيد،  
وجمعة، فالمكلف مخاطب بكما جميعا العيد على  
أنه سنة، والجمعة على أنها فرض، ولا ينوب  
أحدهما عن الآخر وهذا هو الاصل إلا أن  
يثبت في ذلك شرع يجب المصير إليه.

ومن تمسك بقول عثمان، فلانه رأي أن مثل  
ذلك ليس هو بالرأي وإنما هو توفيق وليس هو  
بخارج عن الاصول كل الخروج.

وأما إسقاط فرض الظهر والجمعة التي هي بدله  
لمكان صلاة العيد فخارج عن الاصول جدا،  
إلا أن يثبت في ذلك شرع يجب المصير إليه.

واختلفوا فيمن تفوته صلاة العيد مع الامام،  
فقال قوم يصلي أربعاً، وبه قال أحمد والثوري  
وهو مروى عن ابن مسعود.

<sup>3</sup> It is a *sunnah mu‘akkadah* according to the most correct *fatwā* of Mālik (Khalīl, *al-Mukhtasar*), and *wājib* according to Abū Hanīfah (Qudūri, *al-Mukhtasar*)

<sup>4</sup> Note that the Hanafīs, Mālikīs and Shāfi‘īs are unanimous that residents of the city are obliged to pray both the ‘īd and Friday prayers. This is the preponderant majority opinion of the people of the *sunnah*.

<sup>5</sup> Please see endnote i at the end of this paper.

A group of them said that [such a person] should make up [the 'īd prayer], praying it like the 'īd prayer is prayed: two *raka'āt* in which one makes the *takbīrs* just as one would do so in the 'īd prayer, and one recites out loud just as one would do so in it. This is the opinion of Shāfi'ī, [may Allah have mercy on him], and Abū Thawr.

[Another] group of them said that he should just pray two [normal] *raka'āt*, in which he neither recites out loud, nor makes any of the [extra] *takbīrs* of the 'īd prayer.

[Yet another] group of them said that if the Imām has prayed in the same place [that the one who missed the prayer is praying], then he should pray two *raka'āt*; if he is praying in a place other than the *muṣallā* [of the Imām], then he makes up four *raka'āt*.

[And yet another] group of them said that he is basically neither obliged to [nor is he able to] make up [the 'īd] prayer. This is the *fatwā* of Mālik and his companions. [The great third century *mujtahid*] Ibn al-Mundhir [also] relates [from Mālik] an opinion similar to that of Shāfi'ī [may Allah have mercy on them all].

As for those who said that [he must make up] four [*raka'āt*], he has made it [i.e. the 'īd prayer] the equivalent to the Friday prayer. This is a weak comparison.

وقال قوم: بل يقضيها على صفة صلاة الإمام  
ركعتين يكبر فيهما نحو تكبيره، ويجهر  
كجهره، وبه قال الشافعي، وأبو ثور

وقال قوم: بل ركعتين فقط لا يجهر فيهما ولا  
يكبر تكبير العيد

وقال قوم: إن صلى الإمام في المصلى صلى  
ركعتين، وإن صلى في غير المصلى صلى أربع  
ركعات

وقال قوم: لا قضاء عليه أصلا، وهو قول  
مالك وأصحابه وحكى ابن المنذر عنه مثل  
قول الشافعي.

فمن قال: أربعا شبهها بصلاة الجمعة، وهو  
تشبيهه ضعيف،

Those who said that [he must make up] two *raka'āt* in the way that the Imām prayed them go towards the position that the default state is that a make-up prayer should be performed in the manner of the prayer missed.

Those who said that [the *'īd* prayer] cannot be made up, [say so] because it is a prayer [whose validity] is conditioned on [the presence of] the congregation and the Imam, similar to the Friday prayer. For this reason one is not obliged to make it up through two or four *raka'āt*, as [even if he prayed them] they wouldn't mean anything [as a true replacement to the *'īd* prayer]. These two rulings are the ones in which there is a [valid] difference of opinion, by which I mean the opinions of Mālik<sup>6</sup> and Shāfi'ī.

As for the rest of the rulings [mentioned] on this issue, they are weak, and meaningless, because the Friday prayer replaces, [however is different from] *ḍhuhr*, and these [i.e. the set of four *raka'āt*] don't seem to stand in the place of anything, [in that they are prayed before the time that *ḍhuhr* comes in, so they cannot validly be considered *ḍhuhr*, and since they are four, they don't even resemble *'īd* or the Friday prayer. This being so,] how can one construct the analogy of one to the other for the purposes of making the prayer up?

In reality even one who misses the Friday prayer and then prays *ḍhuhr*, isn't *making up* the Friday prayer, as one cannot stand [equally] in the place of the other. Rather he is [only] praying [his normal] *ḍhuhr* as an [inferior] *replacement* for it, [i.e. the Friday prayer] which he missed, and which was obligatory upon him.<sup>7</sup>

And Allah is the One who gives the ability to find that which is correct.

<sup>6</sup> Abu Hanīfah and Mālik both have the same opinion.

<sup>7</sup> Note that by this tract further Ibn Rushd emphatically restates his opinion that the *'īd* prayer logically cannot replace the Friday prayer.

ومن قال: ركعتين، كما صلاهما الامام،  
فمصييرا إلى أن الاصل هو أن القضاء يجب أن  
يكون على صفة الاداء،

ومن منع القضاء، فلانه رأى أنها صلاة من  
شرطها الجماعة والامام - كالجمعة - فلم  
يجب قضاؤها ركعتين، ولا أربعا إذ ليست هي  
بدلا من شيء،

وهذان القولان، هما اللذان يتردد فيهما النظر:  
أعني قول الشافعي، وقول مالك.

وأما سائر الاقاويل في ذلك فضعيف لا معنى  
له، لان صلاة الجمعة بدل من الظهر، وهذه  
ليست بدلا من شيء، فكيف يجب أن تقاس  
إحداهما على الاخرى في القضاء؟

وعلى الحقيقة، فليس من فاتته الجمعة، فصلاته  
الظهر قضاء، بل هي أداء، لانه إذا فاتته البدل،  
وجبت هي، والله الموفق للصواب.

---

<sup>i</sup> Ibn Rushd was considered to be a master of the rational sciences. It is for this reason that he digests the *fiqh* of the four *madhhabs* and the people of the *sunnah* from a mostly rationalist perspective. It is from this perspective that he dismisses as baseless the opinion that the 'īd prayer can obviate the obligation of, or substitute for the Friday prayer.

As for one who would say that there are *ḥadīths* that indicate that the messenger of Allah, may the peace and blessings of Allah be upon him, allowed the people to

(a) skip the Friday prayer, after having prayed the 'īd prayer,

or that his blessed *ḥadīths* indicate that

(b) the Friday prayer can be validly prayed in the time between after sunrise and noon, thus making the 'īd prayer, which consists of two *raka'āt* and a *khuṭbah*, effectively into a valid Friday prayer; the response is as follows.

The obligation of praying the Friday prayer, as well as the valid discharge of the obligation of praying the Friday prayer in the time of *ḍhuhr* is established by *tawātur*, meaning that it comes through so many narrations and other channels that there is no denying or questioning their validity. One who does so is deemed to be outside of the pale of Islam. This is a point on which all of the people of the *sunnah* agree.

If one wishes to modify either these two points they must either bring some kind of rational proof, which would be admissible as long as no *ḥadīth* is explicitly contrary to it; or they must bring a *ḥadīth* or narration that is at least as strong as those *ḥadīths* or narrations about the default rulings regarding the Friday prayer and its timings that they break (a) or modify (b).

Ibn Rushd is methodical in showing that a rational proof is not forthcoming. He also maintains, as do the Ḥanafīs, Mālikīs, Shāfi'īs that there is no *ḥadīth* which is strong enough to prove the validity of breaking or changing the default rulings regarding the Friday prayers and its timings. This is what he means when he says "... unless there is some explicit legislation to the contrary, which [is so strong that one] is obliged to follow it." (next column)

---

(continued )The Ḥanbalīs don't claim any rational backing for (a) or (b), rather they bring some *ḥadīths* and narrations which they feel fulfill the conditions necessary to either break or modify the default rulings about the Friday prayer and its timings. It is for this reason that the People of the *Sunnah* hold that the views of the Ḥanbalīs regarding this issue are a valid difference of opinion, despite the majority of *Sunni* scholarship not accepting them as correct.

My reason for preparing this tract was not to categorically claim that the Ḥanbali opinion is totally baseless; rather I notice that the average Muslim in my area seems to be under the false impression that the Ḥanbali opinion is the only one, and that all others are incorrect. This is not only untrue, but it also ignores the fact that the obligation of praying both the 'īd and Friday prayers is established by the rulings of the overwhelming majority of the scholars of Islam throughout the ages.

For further reading on the Ḥanbali basis for the validity of not praying the Friday prayer after praying the 'īd prayer, please see *al-Mughnī* of Ibn Qudāmah al-Maqdisī.